

An Approach to Translation Criticism

Emma and Madame Bovary in translation

Lance Hewson

ETI, University of Geneva

John Benjamins Publishing Company

Amsterdam / Philadelphia

Table of contents

Acknowledgements	IX
CHAPTER 1	
Introduction	1
1.1 Translation Quality Assessment	3
1.2 Translation criticism	5
1.2.1 Leuven-Zwart and Koster: “shifts” and the <i>tertium comparationis</i>	7
1.2.2 Armin Paul Frank and the transfer-oriented approach	10
1.2.3 Antoine Berman’s “critique”	11
1.2.4 Corpus Based Translation Studies	13
1.3 In search of a new model	15
1.3.1 Source vs. target	16
1.3.2 Terminology	17
1.3.3 Identifying passages and the micro-meso-macro-level relationship	18
1.3.4 The question of style	18
1.3.5 The <i>tertium comparationis</i>	19
1.3.6 The critic’s interpretative position	20
1.4 A brief outline of methodology	24
1.4.1 Preliminary data	24
1.4.2 The critical framework	26
1.4.3 Micro- and meso-level analysis	26
1.4.4 Macro-level analysis	27
1.5 Corpus	27
1.6 Concluding remarks	28
CHAPTER 2	
From preliminary data to the critical framework	31
2.1 <i>Madame Bovary</i>	32
2.1.1 Preliminary data for <i>Madame Bovary</i>	32
2.1.1.1 Editions of <i>Madame Bovary</i>	32
2.1.1.2 English translations of <i>Madame Bovary</i>	33
2.1.1.3 The macrostructure of the six <i>Madame Bovary</i> translations	36
2.1.2 The critical framework for <i>Madame Bovary</i>	36
2.1.3 The choice of passages for <i>Madame Bovary</i>	42

- 2.2 *Emma* 43
 - 2.2.1 Preliminary data for *Emma* 43
 - 2.2.1.1 Editions of *Emma* 43
 - 2.2.1.2 French translations of *Emma* 44
 - 2.2.1.3 The macrostructure of the three *Emma* translations 47
 - 2.2.2 The critical framework for *Emma* 48
 - 2.2.3 The choice of passages for *Emma* 50
- 2.3 From the critical framework to the initial reading 50
- 2.4 Conclusion 51

CHAPTER 3

Describing translational choices and their effects

53

- 3.1 A passage from *Madame Bovary* 54
- 3.2 A passage from *Emma* 56
- 3.3 Tools and metalanguage for describing translational choices 58
 - 3.3.1 Describing syntactic choice 59
 - 3.3.1.1 Syntactic calque and partial calque 59
 - 3.3.1.2 Overall form 62
 - 3.3.1.3 Fronting 63
 - 3.3.1.4 Juxtaposition 64
 - 3.3.1.5 Extraposition 65
 - 3.3.1.6 Recategorization 65
 - 3.3.1.7 Modulation 66
 - 3.3.1.8 Other syntactic choices 67
 - 3.3.2 Describing lexical choice 67
 - 3.3.2.1 Established equivalent 67
 - 3.3.2.2 Borrowing, explicitation, implicitation, hyperonymy and hyponymy 67
 - 3.3.2.3 Description and cultural adaptation 69
 - 3.3.2.4 Modification and radical modification 69
 - 3.3.2.5 Creation 69
 - 3.3.3 Describing grammatical choice 70
 - 3.3.3.1 Tense and aspect 70
 - 3.3.3.2 Modality 74
 - 3.3.4 Describing stylistic choice 75
 - 3.3.4.1 Repetition, appellatives, and anaphoric devices 76
 - 3.3.4.2 Cliché 77
 - 3.3.4.3 Trope 77
 - 3.3.4.4 Rhythm 79
 - 3.3.4.5 Alliteration and assonance 80
 - 3.3.4.6 Register 80
 - 3.3.4.7 Connotation 81

3.3.5	Overriding translational choices: Addition and Elimination	81
3.3.5.1	Addition	81
3.3.5.2	Elimination	82
3.3.6	Free indirect discourse (FID)	82
3.4	Meso-level effects	83
3.4.1	Voice effects	85
3.4.2	Interpretational effects	86
3.4.3	The question of impact	87
3.5	Meso-level analyses	88
3.5.1	Passage 3:1	88
3.5.2	Passage 3:2	90
3.6	Conclusion	92
CHAPTER 4		
	Two translations of <i>Emma</i>	93
4.1	The social framework	93
4.2	Looking for clues	109
4.3	The author's narrator and free indirect discourse	122
4.4	Results and conclusion	126
CHAPTER 5		
	Three versions of <i>Madame Bovary</i>	129
5.1	Dialogue	129
5.2	The depiction of iterative "reality"	136
5.3	Fantasy	140
5.3.1	Charles' daydream of Berthe's future	140
5.3.2	Emma's fantasized elopement	144
5.4	Hallucination	152
5.5	Results and conclusion	162
CHAPTER 6		
	The macrostructural level	165
6.1	The macro-level	166
6.2	Macro-level effects	166
6.2.1	Voice effects	167
6.2.2	Interpretational effects	172
6.3	General macro-level categories	178
6.3.1	From "divergent similarity" to "adaptation"	179
6.4	Drawing up hypotheses	184
6.5	Conclusion	189

CHAPTER 7	
Radical divergence and adaptation	191
7.1 Saint-Segond	191
7.2 May and Hopkins	197
7.3 Salesse-Lavergne	207
7.4 Nordon	213
7.5 Conclusion	219
CHAPTER 8	
Relative divergence	221
8.1 Russell	221
8.2 Steegmuller	227
8.3 Conclusion	232
CHAPTER 9	
Divergent similarity	235
9.1 Mauldon	235
9.2 Wall	241
9.3 Mauldon and Wall compared	244
9.4 Russell and Steegmuller	249
9.5 Hopkins and May	254
CHAPTER 10	
Conclusion	257
10.1 Pitfalls and inherent weaknesses	257
10.2 Results	262
10.3 The need for criticism	265
10.4 The purpose of criticism	267
References	271
1. Primary sources	271
2. Secondary sources	271
3. Websites	277
Subject index	279
Name index	281